



Human Resource Organizing In Iranian Educational System: A Conceptual Model¹

Saman Majidi², Majid Mohamadi*³, Rafigh Hasani⁴

ARTICLE INFO

Article history:

Received:

08/09/2022

Accepted:

11/03/2023

Available online:

Winter 2023

Keyword:

Human resource organization, professional competence, general competence, meritocratic logical improvement of human resources

Abstract

The organization of human resources plays a pivotal role in guiding individuals toward personal growth and professional advancement in their work lives. This study presents a framework for understanding the existing patterns of human resources organization within the Iranian education system. To that end, a qualitative approach was used, specifically, phenomenology. The qualitative phase of this study involved participants from various backgrounds, including education officials, human resources managers, experts, experienced teachers, and education managers in the Kurdistan province. The participants were selected via purposeful sampling from individuals who could provide insights concerning the organization of human resources in the education sector of the Kurdistan region. The interview process continued until theoretical saturation. Ninety-nine initial themes were extracted in the first step, based on the applied coding system, which was reduced to 55 later. According to the coding results of the first question, six major subjects were identified. The six major themes identified were professional competence, general competence, land preparation, logical enhancement of human resources, intelligent needs assessment, and general competencies.

Majidi, S., Mohamadi, M., & Hasani, R. (2023). Human Resource Organizing In Iranian Educational System: A Conceptual Model, *Journal of School Administration*, 10(4), 164-191.

1. This article is derived from the doctoral thesis on educational administration conducted at the Islamic Azad University of Sanandaj Branch, Sanandaj, Iran.

2. Ph.d Student in educational administration, Sanandaj Branch, Islamic Azad University, Sanandaj, Iran.

3. Department of Educational Sciences, Sanandaj Branch, Islamic Azad University, Sanandaj, Iran.

* Corresponding Author: Email:majid.mohamadi2622@gmail.com

4. Department of Educational Sciences, Sanandaj Branch, Islamic Azad University, Sanandaj, Iran.

Introduction

In the present era, human resources and their constructive role in delivering services is imperative to the success and survival of any organization. The ability of organizations and companies to identify and retain qualified workforces is closely tied to their training efforts. The cultivation and development of human capital are key factors in building this ability. Human Resource Development encompasses the enhancement of individuals' constructive and efficient capabilities. Abilities and capabilities consist of knowledge, skills, and experience that possess economic value. The effective utilization of human resources in educational, technical, economic, agricultural organizations, institutions, and other fields necessitates the development and training of skilled and efficient individuals (Fadayi Keyvani and Sadat eshkevarri, 2016). Human resources form an integral factor of production. They are the assets of the organization, and play a fundamental role in organizational success, supporting and facilitating this process. Human resources, being the most crucial asset of any organization, poses significant challenges in terms of management and leadership. Managers in this field encounter numerous and diverse problems. Neglecting this sector can result in wasted time and substantial, irreversible costs for the organization (Mousavi and Kohkhazadeh, 2018). The importance of human resources in organizations cannot be emphasized enough, as they play a vital role in achieving predetermined goals. Human resources hold a significant position in every organization and are regarded as its primary capital (Bigdeli, Davoudi, Kamali, Naghl, and Entesarfarmani,

2017). In that respect, Research conducted by Kacherachikov, Tokarkikova, and Blaskova (2015) suggests that human capital management is a deliberate and strategic approach to effectively managing the organization's most valuable assets, its workforce. Gioekyung and Vozyongsin (2013) discovered that organizing human resources involves internal factors, including motivation, diligence, self-awareness, resolve, self-regulation, and more.

Given that human resources are currently recognized as an invaluable factor in production and an imperative organizational capital, as well as the key source of competitive advantage and the foundation for developing organizational capabilities, human resource planning becomes a crucial aspect of organizational planning. Planning to meet skills and educational needs is a crucial aspect of human resource planning, as it ultimately leads to the enhancement of human resources. Enhancing the efficiency and effectiveness of employees within organizations is the most effective approach to attaining competitive advantage in the present context. It is crucial to recognize that the development of human resources encompasses more than just technical and specialized training. Employee development plays a vital role in this process. Implementing strategic management in human resource management is essential for achieving this important component (Biukani et al., 2013). According to Kanbari, Fallah, and Zamani (2015), the Ministry of Education is the largest organization in the country in terms of the number of employees. The organization's mission involves training the human resources

required by various departments in the country and managing and organizing the human resources within the organization. It is recognized that the development of human resources is of utmost importance in today's world. Economists argue that the economic and social development of a country is ultimately specified by its human resources, rather than its capital or other material resources. According to Fada'i Keivani and Sadat Ashkuri (2016), a country's ability to develop its people's skills and knowledge and effectively apply them to the national economy is vital. Without this capability, the country will struggle to develop in any other aspect. According to Ahmadi, Bablan Ahmadi, Moradi, and Khaleghkhah (2016), the attraction, cultivation, maintenance, and effective implementation of human resources as a valuable strategic asset necessitates deliberate and enthusiastic measures and actions. To achieve this, it is essential to train qualified, knowledgeable, and experienced professionals who can lead both small and large organizations toward their desired socioeconomic goals. This ability is regarded as a specialized art. Enhancing productivity is a crucial objective for any organization. Since human beings play a central role in driving productivity, their involvement and satisfaction within the organization leave a significant impact. On the contrary, the superiority of one organization over another is determined by its human resources, which dictate its functioning and ultimately the efficiency of the organization. According to Mardanishahr and Khaki (2018), the human resources of an organization are its most crucial and valuable asset. Azad (2018) hold that one of the challenges in strategic human resource management

for organizations is determining the strategies and actions that will lead to organizational success and effectively develop employees who can serve as a sustainable competitive edge. In traditional human resource management, the focus was solely on evaluating employee performance and task completion. However, in the modern perspective of human resources and talent management, employees are seen as partners in the organization. It is argued that to retain them, the organization should recognize and value their aspirations and dreams. Ahmadi et al. (2016) argue that each manager is responsible for nurturing and retaining their own valuable workforce. This is in contrast to traditional thinking, where the human resources department was solely responsible for recruitment and retention. With strategic insight, managers, particularly human resource managers, go beyond solely assessing employee performance. They employ effective measures to attract, retain, enhance, and optimally utilize human resources. The aim is to cultivate individuals who possess the necessary skills, personality traits, and alignment with the organization's culture and mission. Instead of relying on constant monitoring and supervision, these individuals exhibit a strong work ethic and a deep-rooted work culture. (Biukani, Omid-e Asl, Karimi, 2013). The Twenty-Year Economic, Social, and Cultural Development Plan of the Islamic Republic of Iran envisions the importance of Human Resources. The plan aims to position Iran as the leading country in the region in terms of Human Resources by the end of the long-term program. (Ahmadi et al., 2016).

The significance of education has increased in today's world due to the

rapid pace of change and complexity. This is attributed to the necessity of preparing individuals to fulfill various societal roles and address their diverse and intricate requirements. According to Salehiamin and Pourreza (2014), educational organizations serve a pivotal role in society as they are responsible for providing formal education to individuals. Additionally, these organizations hold significant importance as they serve as the primary suppliers of human resources for other organizations. The transformation of the current education system in the country is an unavoidable necessity. To ensure optimal education, it is crucial to attract and retain skilled personnel. Consequently, it becomes imperative to develop programs and implement supportive measures that foster the necessary motivation for their continued engagement and success. According to Ahmadi et al. (2016), these programs and support measures for employees have several outcomes, with the most significant being the strong motivation to serve the organizational purpose and the eagerness to go above and beyond in order to accomplish the objectives of education. According to the Fundamental Transformation Document on Education and Training (2011), the leadership and management system in the Islamic Republic of Iran is described as an efficient, effective, and perfectionist system. It relies on exceptional human resources and operates within a regional context that promotes learning, justice, participation, and adherence to Islamic ethics. The system aims to foster righteous action, create an elevated and transformative atmosphere, and embody qualities such as revolution, foresight, wisdom,

commitment, faithfulness, insightfulness, and righteousness

In the education system education managers serve as human resources accountants responsible for monitoring and managing the status of human resources in an appropriate manner demonstrating care seriousness integrity and trust. The measures undertaken to organize human resources in education encompass the creation of an estimation table for educational factors, the establishment of an assessment table, the documentation of organizational units within the unit system, the scheduling of human resource organization, and the implementation of an online and 24/7 support team for managing human resources. According to Saleh Amin and Pur Reza (2014), the education system has implemented various programs that have resulted in the generation of 50 reports on the status of human resources. These reports have been shared with different departments and areas, facilitating communication and feedback. Additionally, the establishment of the Provincial Working Group on provincial human resource organization has been instrumental in addressing issues and problems specific to cities and regions. The group has been responsible for issuing and confirming personnel reports, further enhancing the province's efforts in this regard. The primary concern addressed in this research is the significant shortage of skilled and specialized human resources in the province of Kurdistan, Iran. Furthermore, the utilization of untrained, inexperienced, and unrelated forces has exacerbated the issues in addressing the deficiencies, leading to numerous complications. To avoid the shutdown of classrooms, authorities have no choice but to plan to employ

inadequately trained and ill-equipped forces to undertake the grand task of education. Insufficient and untimely planning in recruiting adequately trained personnel, coupled with authorities' limited knowledge in human resource recruitment and utilization, as well as the neglect of upkeep, training, and information updates, have prompted the researcher to explore a viable solution for addressing this crucial issue within the education system of the Kurdistan region. This is while previous studies have overlooked this particular subject, focusing primarily on comparing and studying organizational variables or merely providing theoretical attention without delving into its significance, objectives, and impacts. Presently, there is a notable level of discontentment, particularly within the organization's forces, regarding organizational affairs. This dissatisfaction has frequently resulted in a decline in the quality of education and an increase in public dissatisfaction. Furthermore, the introduction of untrained initiatives, such as employing unskilled labor for the educational services procurement program and recruiting incompetent assistant teachers of the Literacy Movement Organization of Iran and unqualified preschool instructors, has exacerbated the organizational challenges related to human resources. Given the aforementioned points, the main inquiry revolves around the drawbacks associated with the current organizational structure of human resources in the Iranian education system. Additionally, it is crucial to explore an alternative model for organizing human resources in the education system of Kurdistan. This alternative model aims to address the identified issues and improve the overall

efficiency and effectiveness of the system.

Methodology

In this investigation, a qualitative and phenomenological methodology was employed. The statistical community of this investigation in its qualitative sector includes the officials, human resources organizing managers, experts, as well as experienced teachers and managers working in the education sector in Kurdistan. Accordingly, 21 participants were selected via purposeful sampling. The participants had a specialty in education human resources management in the province. After conducting interviews with the initial 21 participants, the coding process was carried out based on guidance and advice provided by seven respected teachers, counselors, and members of the Human Resources Organization within the General Education Department of Kurdistan. The given views and responses to the coded questions were fully recorded and the related subjects and themes were extracted. This process continued until theoretical saturation. The interview was stopped when no more information could be extracted from the collected data.

The data were gathered by means of a semi-structured interview. Interviews were conducted between July and September 2021. This interview consists of a set of nine relevant questions concerning human resource organization. The interviewees were given the freedom to provide detailed elaborations on their responses. The interviews were conducted virtually via WhatsApp or email, with a duration ranging from 40 to 60 minutes, depending on the circumstances of the participants. The interviews were

concluded based on the concept of theoretical saturation.

For the analysis of interview data, the Brown and Clark thematic analysis method (2006) was employed. The thematic analysis involves the process of coding and analyzing data to uncover the underlying data meanings. When a pattern of data is identified, it is essential to provide supporting evidence or references to substantiate the findings. In essence, themes emerge from data (Mohammadpur, 2013). According to Brown and Clarke (2006), the data analysis process involves three primary stages: text description, text analysis, and text integration. In the initial stage, the data is arranged chronologically, and preliminary coding is implemented. This stage encompasses three steps: acquaintance with the text, initial code generation, and themes search and

identification. The data analysis phase involves data organization, regulation, and categorization. Data coding and categorization were performed at this stage. Data analysis consisted of two steps: The initial stage involves extracting themes, followed by establishing effective communication between these themes via an appropriate thematic map. Based on the data reduction process and the successful implementation of primary open coding, the key themes were determined and the interrelationships were investigated and finalized. During the text synthesis and integration phase, a comprehensive final report is generated, incorporating a re-analysis of the subjects and linking them to the relevant literature. The analyses were primarily conducted using a comparative approach. The report was then completed.

Table 1- The demographics of the participants

Place of Service	History of organizing human resources	Educational history	Organizational Position	Education	Gender	Row
Devandarreh	20	5	Deputy head of primary education of Devandarreh	Master of Educational Sciences	Male	1
Baneh	5	25	Educational guide	Master of Sciences	Male	2
Baneh	1	32	Educational Deputy of School	Master of Sciences	Male	3
Saghez	11	12	Expert in Educational Groups	Master of Education and Training	Female	4
Sanandaj	8	12	Assessment Expert	Master of Sciences	Male	5
Baneh	0	5	Educational guide	Master of Psychology	Male	6
Baneh	10	10	Performance assessment expert	Master of Sciences	Male	7

Baneh	8	12	Assessment expert	Master of Educational Management	Male	8
Kamyaran	2	26	Instructor	Doctoral student	Male	9
Bijar	0	5	Teacher	Master of Sciences	Male	10
Baneh	5	30	Educational Deputy	Undergraduate	Male	11
Saghez	16	30	Former director of Education of Baneh; currently, a high-school principal in Saghez.	Ph.D. in Accounting	Male	12
Baneh	4	14	Primary Education Expert	Master of Planning	Male	13
Baneh	6	20	Boarding High School Master	Ph.D.	Male	14
Degelan	6	29	Deputy head of primary education	Master of Planning	Male	15
Marivan	11	11	Primary Education Expert	Master of Planning	Male	16
Saghez	1	29	Primary Education Expert	Master of Educational Sciences	Female	17
Sanandaj	4	28	Deputy Director of Development of the General Administration.	Ph.D.	Male	18
Saghez	12	16	Founder of Private Schools	Expert of Educational Sciences	Male	19
Marivan	1	29	Deputy head of primary education	Master of Sciences	Female	20
Zeyvieh	9	24	Educational guide	Master of Sciences	Male	21
The General Education Directorate of Kurdistan	10	15	Expert in Research and planning of Human Resources at the Ministry of Education	Doctoral student	Male	22

//	15	26	Head of the Human Resources Planning Department of the Ministry of Education	Master of Sciences	Male	23
//	14	24	The Recruitment Department Expert	Master of Sciences	Male	24
//	10	21	The Human Resources Expert of the General Administration.	Master of Sciences	Male	25
//	16	26	Former Deputy Director of Human Resources Development of the General Ministry of Education.	Former Doctor of Educational Management	Male	26
//	16	28	Deputy Director of Primary Education of the Ministry of Education.	Master of Sciences	Female	27
//	18	31	Former Expert on Primary Education at the Ministry of Education	Master of Sciences	Female	28

Findings

Question 1: As an informed individual, please share your experience in organizing human resources, with a specific focus on organizing teachers.

In response, the data were collected from the interviews. By employing the thematic analysis method, the initial step involved categorizing the fundamental themes, followed by extracting the organizing themes.

Table 2. Basic and organizing themes derived from interviews

Organizing themes	Basic themes
Absence of of structural strategy in the organization	The superficiality of privileges Not following the interests of the organization The obtained privileges being fake Overcoming personal demands and goals over organizational goals
Weak enactment	Dissatisfaction Lawlessness Indecisiveness Not Implement Organizational Rules and Regulations Intransparency Discrimination non-compliance with the codes and instructions
Information Surveillance	Preparing the conditions for women Thorough Acquaintance with all regions and villages Familiarity with environmental conditions Field-specific data collection Place of service selection Relevance to the cultural-social-economical status per each region Checking the scores obtained in previous months
Multifacetedness	Difficult Process Sophistication Being challenging Technicality Systematicity

In the first step, ninety-nine initial themes were extracted based on the applied coding system. which were reduced to 25 later. According to the coding results of the first question, four major subjects were identified. These four organizing themes include lack of structural strategy in the organization, weak implementation, Information surveillance, and multifacetedness.

The absence of a structural strategy within the organization is one of the organizing themes identified. The response of an interviewee to the relevant questions is as such:

I believe that the organization is built upon outdated routines and privileges that are often unrealistic, particularly in relation to the school. This has led to dissatisfaction among employees

and has negatively impacted service delivery.

Another interviewee's remark concerning the weak implementation:

Based on my experience, it is evident that the absence of determination and appropriate legislation, as well as the failure to consider employee satisfaction and align organizational goals, policy-making, and planning, have had a significant impact on employee behavior, thinking, and performance.

Another interviewee's remark concerning information surveillance:

By conducting an analysis of the cultural, social, and economic conditions in each region and reviewing the scores from previous

months, it is possible to pave the way for effective organizational planning.

Another interviewee's remark concerning information surveillance:

In my opinion, having knowledge about environmental conditions, gathering information specifically from any major, and closely monitoring the information can serve as a solid foundation for organizational efforts.

Another interviewee's remark concerning multifacetedness:

In my opinion, the complexity and challenges associated with

organizational systems have always been serious issues.

Question II: In organization efforts that are focused on organizing instructors, what points are taken into account?

To answer that question, the data were collected from the interviews. By employing the thematic analysis method, the initial step involved categorizing the fundamental themes, followed by extracting the organizing themes.

Table 3. Basic and organizing themes derived from interviews

Organizing themes	Basic themes
Concentration on meritocracy	Specialty Interest History Ability Degree (post-diploma, Bachelor's, Master's, and Ph.D.)
The centrality of physical health	Physically healthy Medical records
Land preparation	Roosting Presence of some teachers in some rural regions Designation of teachers to work in remote villages Anticipating workforce needs Gender-based organization Major-based organization Specialty-specific placement Serving at different levels in rural areas
Expedient thinking	The remarks of authorities Expediency
Rewards and privileges	Rewards (obtained ranks in research programs) Veterans privileges Attending in-service training courses In-service training hours Participation in the workshop Articles Ranking in conferences

In the first step, 42 initial themes were extracted based on the applied coding system. which were reduced to 24 later. According to the coding results of the

first question, five major subjects were identified: Emphasis on meritocracy, the centrality of physical health, land

preparation, expedient thinking, and privileges and encouragement.

Emphasis on meritocracy was one of the organizing themes. The response of an interviewee to the relevant questions is as such:

Observing the principles of organization, including the proper division of classes and paying attention to interest, is considered highly important. Merit, adherence to the principle of meritocracy in scoring, and employment of experienced experts.

Another interviewee's remark concerning the centrality of physical health:

Paying attention to organizational principles, including physical and mental health, holds significant importance.

Another interviewee's remark concerning land preparation:

Attention should be given to the conditions of the employees and their geographical position. It is essential to provide suitable conditions for roosting.

Another interviewee's remark concerning expedient thinking:

Considering the ideas and recommendations of inexperienced individuals and unscientific expedient attitudes have consistently led to these issues.

Another interviewee's remark concerning incentives and privileges:

In my opinion, prioritizing the organization of tasks and activities that are directly related to earning points and advancing one's career is crucial.

Question III: What challenges can be encountered when organizing human resources, specifically focusing on the organization of teachers?

Accordingly, the data were collected from the interviews. By employing the thematic analysis method, the initial step involved categorizing the fundamental themes, followed by extracting the organizing themes.

Table 4. Basic and organizing themes derived from interviews

Organizing themes	Basic themes
Weak decision-making	Unfavorable conditions for some instructors Delayed selection Inappropriate choices Unwanted presence and rushing to finish tasks
Cronyism-based meritocracy	Employment of unfit individuals The interference of extra-educational entities Delegating incompetent employees Unwieldy administrative instructions
Weak professional ethics	Forging documents to earn scores Truancy To shirk teaching Getting used to dodging work Lack of interest in teaching
Weak needs assessment	Educator shortage Statistical fluctuations of students Failure to estimate the quantity of sparsely populated rural schools First and sixth grades remaining empty Under-the-norm status of many villages
Weak preparation	zero situational knowledge zero cultural knowledge Zero knowledge of the workplace Employment of non-tenured instructors and redundancy payment Not holding training sessions and courses No internship programs The unfamiliarity of non-native employees with the villages of the workplace

In the first step, 28 initial themes were extracted based on the applied coding system, which were reduced to 27 later. According to the coding results of the first question, five major subjects were identified: Weak decision-making, cronyism-based management, weak professional ethics, weak needs assessment, and weak preparation. Weak decision-making was one of the organizing themes. The response of an interviewee to the relevant questions is as such:

There is a lack of willingness to hire competent individuals. Conversely, there is a tendency to dismiss or

refrain from hiring and replacing incompetent individuals.

Another interviewee's remark concerning management without meritocracy:

Short working experience, lack of knowledge of learners, and unfit expertise dramatically influence organization.

Another interviewee's remark concerning weak professional behavior:

There are consistent instances of misconduct, such as document forgery to gain better scores and truancy.

Another interviewee's remark concerning weak needs assessment:

I strongly support the notion that this recurring issue, which arises from the failure to accurately estimate the number of sparsely populated rural schools, leads to significant inconsistencies.

Another interviewee's remark concerning weak preparation:

Employment of unfit personnel and inaccurate assessment of resources have consistently led to numerous challenges.

Question IV: What are the negative consequences of the current system, particularly regarding the organization of teachers?

To answer this question, the data were collected from the conducted interviews. By employing the thematic analysis method, the initial step involved categorizing the fundamental themes, followed by extracting the organizing themes.

Table 5. Basic and organizing themes derived from interviews

Organizing themes	Basic themes
No development of improvement efforts	Employment of ineffective forces Insistence on educational employment gaps with unqualified forces
Zero organizational commitment	Employee proclamations Prioritizing personal goals over organizational goals Lack of empathy
Absence of a meritocratic system	No efficient training programs The discrepancy between scientific research and the performance of the educational system No system to evaluate employee performance Disorderly enactment of plans Inconsistency between organizational goals and plans No healthy route to reward participation in retraining courses
Intentional discouragement	Working based on personal preference Group dependencies Economic rent within the administration Cronyism Discrimination
Weak professional ethics	Trying to gain superficial privileges Excessive documentation and trying to win higher scores Doing low-impact superficial activities solely to gain scores Over-insistence on ranking
Cultural inadaptation	Insufficient understanding of local culture Lack of social interaction Indigenous forces
Negligence to perform land preparation	Severe teacher shortage Using double-shift classrooms Unfavorable conditions for employing new personnel Commuting to cities of residence Inaccurately informing the workforce Inappropriate pre-organization training Deployment of non-tenured teachers on ending days

In the first step, 48 initial themes were extracted based on the applied coding system. According to the coding results of the first question, seven major subjects were identified: no development of improvement efforts, zero organizational commitment, absence of a meritocratic system, Intentional discouragement, weak professional ethics, cultural inadaptation, and negligence toward land preparation.

Another organizing theme is the zero development of improvement efforts. The response of an interviewee to this question is as such:

The staff allocation process often results in the entry of inefficient employees into the system, while highly qualified staff are drawn to specialized schools. Additionally, a significant number of privileged teachers consistently choose desirable positions, leaving weaker schools without access to suitable and effective staff.

Another interviewee's remark concerning organizational commitment:

The prioritization of personal goals over organizational goals has consistently posed challenges in achieving organizational objectives.

Another interviewee's statement regarding the absence of a meritocratic system:

In my opinion, the assessment system has consistently undervalued the importance of establishing effective

pathways to recognize and reward participation in retraining programs.

Another interviewee's remark concerning weak professional behavior:

Neglecting proper documentation and solely focusing on personal gain is a detrimental practice that has inflicted significant harm on the organization.

Another interviewee's remark concerning cultural inadaptation:

Based on my personal experience, the disparity in accents between the teacher and students has led to unfavorable classroom conditions and significant disruptions.

Another interviewee's remark concerning negligence toward land preparation:

The practice of deploying non-tenured teachers in ending days, as well as organizing service procurement personnel without certain evaluations have led to serious damages.

Question V: What are the advantages of effectively managing human resources, specifically in terms of organizing teachers?

To answer this question, the data were collected from the conducted interviews. By employing the thematic analysis method, the initial step involved categorizing the fundamental themes, followed by extracting the organizing themes.

Table 6. Basic and organizing themes derived from interviews

Organizing themes	Basic themes
Concentration on specialization	Allocation of scores for participation in workshops Assigning scores to attend credible scientific conferences Importance of participating in in-service courses Efforts to do score-gaining activities
Law-cenredtedness	Emphasis on instructions Adherence to the law
Score modification (based on family allowance)	Scores per dependent Sick children Guardianship of several families
Electronic organization	Preventing the unnecessary presence of individuals Non-native teachers will not have to visit the city where they will work. Preventing tumult and dissatisfaction

In the first step, 27 initial themes were extracted based on the applied coding system. which were reduced to 14 later. According to the coding results of the first question, four major subjects were identified. These four themes included concentration on specialization, law-cenredtedness, privilege reform (based on family allowance privilege), and electronic organization.

Specialization was among the organizing themes. The response of an interviewee to the relevant questions is as such:

The contributions and achievements of employees play a significant role in elections and the overall functioning of an organization. The presence of experts, particularly in educational groups, can greatly enhance the effectiveness of the organization process. Graduates from Farhangian University have a profound influence on the utilization of skilled personnel in various fields.

Another interviewee's remark concerning law-cenredtedness:

Electronic organization ensures the convenience of individuals: non-native teachers will not have to leave

their city for the place of organization, non-related persons are left out of the online organization process, and chaos and general dissatisfaction are avoided.

Another interviewee's remark concerning the privilege reform (based on the family allowance privilege):

Granting privileges based on the number of dependents, such as senior parents and children, can significantly enhance satisfaction.

Another interviewee's remark concerning electronic organization:

With the enforcement of electronic organizing in the last one or two years, non-native teachers are not forced to travel to the place of organization.

Question VI: What points do you think have been left out in the plans to organize human resources that focus on organizing teachers?

To answer the sixth question, the data were collected from the interviews. By employing the thematic analysis method, the initial step involved categorizing the fundamental themes, followed by extracting the organizing themes.

Table 7. Basic and organizing themes derived from interviews

Organizing themes	Basic themes
No directed efforts to improve the quality of education	Incompetence Lack of expertise Lack of creativity in the workplace The low significance of improving the quality of education Not attending in-service training classes Employment of personnel with unrelated education
Disregard for the mental health of personnel	Underestimating the psychological needs of individuals Personal problems of employees Low mental health
Weak land preparation	Commuting schools Nomadic villages Allocation of scores to rural schools Addressing the conditions of the village Number of students Seasonal changes Environmental and regional factors Geographical area Commute situation Roosting
Cultural adaptation	Religion Dialect Status of the indigenous culture

In the first step, 36 initial themes were extracted based on the applied coding system. which were reduced to 30 later. According to the coding results of the first question, four major subjects were identified: absence of directed efforts to improve the quality of education, disregard for the mental health of personnel, weak land preparation, and cultural adaptation.

No directed efforts to improve the quality of education were among the organizing themes in this study. The response of an interviewee to the relevant questions is as such:

The lack of significance in enhancing the quality of education is evident across all programs.

Another interviewee's remark concerning the disregard for the mental health of employees:

Failing to obtain the satisfaction of employees working in their native place of service by giving special incentives and privileges has led some to hesitate to serve in some villages.

Another interviewee's remark concerning weak land preparation:

I believe neglecting to consider the varying number of students, seasonal variations, and environmental and regional factors is an organization's weakness.

Another interviewee's remark concerning cultural inadaptation:

Disregarding the local culture has resulted in numerous serious challenges

Question 7: What are the essential components required for effectively organizing human resources, with a specific focus on organizing teachers?

To answer this question, the data were collected from the conducted interviews. By employing the thematic analysis method, the initial step involved categorizing the fundamental themes, followed by extracting the organizing themes.

Table 8. Basic and organizing themes derived from interviews

Organizing themes	Basic themes
Logical enhancement of human resources	Pragmatism Reinforcing the spirit to do research Accurate employment of the workforce
Process and development factors	In-service Conference Compilation History Specialty Related field Production of educational content Document
General organizational behavior	The significance of organizational interests Enforcement of organizational values Abiding by moral principles Participation in ceremonies Maintaining the ruling organizational culture Vocational-organizational awareness
Special privileges for veterans	Changes in organizational components Granting special privileges Veterans
Occupational Behavior	Work discipline Proper treatment Compliance with administrative regulations
Professional Credentials	Privileges for passing practical units Admission to the multi-level tests Admission to the professional career selection test Qualification test
Adherence to job-specific codes	Collaboration with the school principal Accountability toward parents Addressing the condition of students Attention to attendance or absence of students

In the first step, 57 initial themes were extracted based on the applied coding system, which were reduced to 34 later. According to the coding results

of the first question, seven major subjects were identified: Logical enhancement of human resources, process/development factors, general

organizational behavior, special privileges for veterans, occupational behavior, professional credentials, and adherence to job-specific codes.

Logical enhancement of human resources was one of the organizing themes. The response of an interviewee to the relevant questions is as such:

Providing ongoing training is the only way for the maintaining the skills and knowledge of forces.

Another interviewee's comments concerning process/development factors of general organizational behavior:

At present, there is a significant gap in content production and assessment.

Another interviewee's remark concerning special privileges for veterans:

Distinct privileges for veterans can be strong incentives for our hero veterans.

Another interviewee's remark concerning occupational behavior:

I believe that maintaining good relationships with employees and adhering to administrative rules are

essential aspects that should be prioritized in organizational management and assessment.

Another interviewee's remark concerning professional credentials :

Frequently, I pondered the idea that if I were in charge of planning, I would allocate points for successfully completing the practical components of multi-level tests.

Another interviewee's comment concerning adherence to job-specific codes:

Attracting dropouts and offering special privileges to them in villages, especially female students.

Question VIII: What measures do you believe are essential for addressing the challenges in organizing human resources, particularly in the context of organizing teachers?

To answer this question, the data were collected from the conducted interviews. By employing the thematic analysis method, the initial step involved categorizing the fundamental themes, followed by extracting the organizing themes.

Table 9. Basic and organizing themes derived from interviews

Organizing themes	Basic themes
Maintenance of human resources	Impact of Service in underprivileged areas Contributing to the provision of equal opportunities doing polls among employees In-person training on the proper selection Pre-organization briefing
Accure land preparation	Providing an appropriate place for roosting Reducing class density A decline in the normal quantity of students Solving the commuting problem Decreasing the number of grades in multi-grade classrooms Setting up a grading system to grade villages and urban schools
Emphasis on specialization	Meritocracy Attention to expertise Conference Compilation Related field Production of educational content Employment of Fahangian University personnel
Equal employment opportunities	Avoiding discrimination Granting fair privileges
Designing a reward-based system	The impact of rank on salaries and benefits Salary increases based on the obtained rank The impact of honest service
Employment of the indigenous	Cultural texture Employment of the indigenous

In the first step, 32 initial themes were extracted based on the applied coding system. which were reduced to 29 later. According to the coding results of the first question, six major subjects were identified: human resource retention, accurate land preparation, insistence on specialization, equal employment opportunities, designing a reward-based system, and employment of the indigenous.

Human resource retention was one of the organizing themes. The response of an interviewee to the relevant questions is as such:

Raising the awareness of educators about the organization process on a continuous basis is of utmost importance.

Another interviewee's remark concerning precise land preparation:

To address the issue, it is advisable to avoid clustering a large number of non-native teachers in a single school. This can be achieved by providing suitable roosting places, reducing classroom density, and offering commute services to remote and hard-to-reach locations for teachers.

Another interviewee's comments concerning the emphasis on specialization:

The insistence on having specialization in the field of study and the enhancement of employees' academic level should always be prioritized.

Another interviewee's remark concerning equal employment opportunities:

The implementation of organization and accuracy in overall decision-making is mainly dependent on justice.

Another interviewee's remark concerning a reward-based system:

The importance of honest service and equitable compensation and benefits for individuals should be acknowledged.

Another interviewee's remark concerning the employment of the indigenous.

Given the cultural context of rural areas, it is imperative to organize local individuals who are well-versed in the local culture.

Question IX: According to your perspective, what measures can be taken to enhance the current state of human resource management, particularly in relation to the organization of teachers?

To answer this question, the data were collected from the conducted interviews. By employing the thematic analysis method, the initial step involved categorizing the fundamental themes, followed by extracting the organizing themes.

Table 10. Basic and organizing themes derived from interviews

Organizing themes	Basic themes
Qualitative development of human resources	Employment of experienced forces Employment of highly-skilled forces Preventing unrelated documentation
Dynamic monitoring	Continuous performance assessment Conducting yearly qualification tests
Professional development	The significance of content creation Adoption of novel education methods Concentration on research the shift from quantitative to qualitative components
Equal opportunities	Avoiding nepotism in decision-making Fair organization
Training and improvement of human resources	Holding briefing workshops regarding organization for employees Holding probationary training courses for the workforce Holding briefing sessions before deployment Enriching probationary training programs based on authentic leadership procedures
Participative decision-making system	Attention to the signs of employees Holding polls among educators about organization

In the first step, 37 initial themes were extracted based on the applied coding system. which were reduced to 24 later. According to the coding results of the first question, six major subjects were identified: These six organizing

themes included qualitative development of human resources, dynamic monitoring, professional development, equal opportunities, training and improvement of human

resources, and participative decision-making system.

The qualitative development of human resources was one of the organizing themes. The response of an interviewee to the relevant questions is as such:

I argue that the implementation of meritocracy, the utilization of symbols, and the cultivation of professional competence can significantly enhance the quality of organization. The active involvement of employees in in-person training sessions and the avoidance of unnecessary paperwork and annual qualification tests are also crucial factors to consider.

Another interviewee's remark concerning dynamic monitoring:

In my opinion, it is necessary to thoroughly revise and update the organizational structure, incorporate new content, and branches in education, and adopt innovative learning and teaching methods.

Another interviewee's remark concerning professional development :

It seems to me that the creation of development plans to boost the

morale of employees and strengthen it to increase interest

Another interviewee's remark concerning equal opportunities:

I firmly hold the belief that ensuring the prevention of interference that jeopardizes the well-being of employees and restricts organizational justice is crucial for a high-quality organization.

Another interviewee's comment concerning human resources training and improvement:

It occurs to me that improving the probationary training by focusing on authentic leadership methods can direct the organization path in the right way.

Another interviewee's comment concerning the participative decision-making system :

I believe that an annual, online, polling system can dramatically enhance education quality and satisfaction.

To expand the obtained results, the index data were compared in the following table:

Scoring criteria	Scoring criteria	Indexes
Diploma (100 scores), Associate (125 scores), Bachelor's (150 scores), Master's and Professional Doctorate (175 scores), Specialized Doctorate (225 points), Job-related (100 scores)	Diploma (100 scores), Associate (125 scores), Bachelor's (150 scores), Master's and Professional Doctorate (175 scores), and Specialized Doctorate (225 points)	Degree
5 scores per child (no maximum score)	5 scores per child (max 15 scores)	Child
The guardianship of children, parents, younger brothers, and sisters is equal to 5 scores per person (with a special guardianship form and as approved by the judicial system)	The guardianship of children, parents, younger brothers, and sisters is equal to 1 score per person (with a special guardianship form and as approved by the judicial system)	Guardianship and sponsorship
Granted by: the minister of Education and his/her deputies 10 scores- General Managers of the	Granted by: the minister of Education and his/her deputies 4 scores- General Managers of the	Encouragement

Ministry of Education in provinces and their deputies 8 scores- the head and deputy of administrative branches 6 scores (up to 3 years before organization)	Ministry of Education in provinces and their deputies 3 scores- the head and deputy of administrative branches 2 scores (up to 3 years before organization)	
Per every 10 hours of in-service training, 1 score per every 5 hours of specialized in-service training (up to 3 years before the organization)	Per every 10 hours of in-service training, 1 score (up to 3 years before organization)	In-service
nationwide admission 15 scores- at the province level 8 scores- regional 5 scores (up to 3 years before organization)	nationwide admission 12 scores- at the province level 6 scores- regional 3 scores (up to 3 years before organization)	System of suggestions
5 scores for every hour of service by the educational group head in line with the Human Resource Management System for Education (province/region) and 2 scores for every hour of service provided by the member of the educational group (province/region) (up to 3 years before organization) H	1 score for every hour of service by the educational group head per year in line with the Human Resource Management System for Education (province/region); 0.5 scores for every hour of service provided by the member of the educational group (province/region) (up to 3 years before organization) H	Educational group
5 scores per year for primary multi-grade classes and 2 scores per additional grade (the objective is to teach in all additional grade programs)	Teaching in multi-grade primary classes is equal to 1 score per year and 25% of the score per additional grade (the objective is to teach in all additional grade programs)	Multi-grade classroom
To provide literacy to every individual is equal to 5 scores according to the statistics available in the Literacy Movement and the certificate approved by the organization (up to 3 years before the organization)	To provide literacy to every individual is equal to 1 score according to the statistics available in the Literacy Movement and the certificate approved by the organization (up to 3 years before the organization)	The Literacy Movement
(Maximum acceptable score of this index) A maximum of 25 scores, authorship of a book in education and training is equal to 10 scores (unlimited scores). The score of authoring a book with ISBN is calculated as such: Books up to 50 pages 3 scores / up to 100 pages 8 scores/ over 100 pages 8 scores (For group authorship, the authors are equally scored. Publishing of articles related to education and training in domestic	Authorship of a book in education and training is equal to 8 scores (a maximum of 16 scores). The score of authoring a book with ISBN is calculated as such: Books up to 50 pages 3 scores / up to 100 pages 5 scores/ over 100 pages 8 scores (For group authorship, the authors are equally scored. Publishing of articles related to education and training in domestic and foreign publications (ISI) 5 scores-scientific, research journal 4 scores/scientific-promotional, scientific-specialized, scientific-	

<p>and foreign publications (ISI) 20 scores-scientific, research journals 15 scores/scientific-promotional, scientific-specialized, scientific-educational and journals and monthly education 10 scores (unlimited scores (up to 5 years before organization)(For group authorship, the authors receive equal scores)</p> <p>Publishing of articles in authentic international conferences 83 scores, nationwide 6 scores, provincial 4 scores, provided that a valid certificate of approval and a digital copy of the article are presented (unlimited scores) (For group authorship, the authors receive equal scores) (up to 5 years before organization)</p> <p>Implementation of research projects, approved by the Research Council of the Ministry of Education, 10 scores per project (unlimited scores and up to 5 years before organization)</p> <p>Selected research/instructor: nationwide (10 scores), provincial (7 scores), and regional (4 scores), provided that a valid certificate of approval is presented (a maximum score of 6 and up to 5 years before organization)</p> <p>Selected top researcher: nationwide 10 scores, provincial 6 scores, and regional 2 scores, provided that a valid certificate of approval is presented.</p>	<p>educational and journals and monthly education 3 scores (a maximum of 10 scores (up to 5 years before organization)(For group authorship, the authors receive equal scores)</p> <p>Publication of articles in international valid exhibits (3 scores), national (2 scores), and provincial (1 score), provided that a certificate of approval and a digital copy of the article is presented (a maximum score of 6)</p> <p>(For group authorship, the authors receive equal scores) (up to 5 years before organization)</p> <p>Implementation of research projects, approved by the Research Council of the Ministry of Education, 3 scores per project(a maximum score of 6 and up to 5 years before organization) (For group authorship, the authors receive equal scores)</p> <p>Selected research/instructor: nationwide (3 scores), provincial (2 scores), and regional (1 score), provided that a valid certificate of approval is presented (a maximum score of 6 and up to 5 years before organization)</p> <p>Selected researcher: selected nationwide (3 scores), provincial (2 scores), and regional (1 score), provided that a valid certificate of approval is presented (a maximum score of 6 and up to 5 years before organization)</p>	<p>Compilation, writing, and research</p>
---	---	---

Discussion and conclusion

This study aimed to identify the components and different dimensions of human resource organization in education. In order to achieve this objective, the theoretical foundations and background of the research were thoroughly examined, focusing on the dimensions mentioned earlier. Research has indicated that various patterns and

models have been proposed by researchers to organize human resources in different organizations. However, there is currently no comprehensive model available specifically for organizing human resources in the Ministry of Education. Theorists hold that the goals individuals set for themselves within an organization significantly influence their level of

motivation. It is argued that external motivators play a crucial role in driving individuals' motivation through the type and clarity of goals, their attainability, and the presence of clear pathways to achieve them. Accordingly, individuals who have the opportunity to select or pursue meaningful goals upon entering an organization tend to exhibit higher levels of motivation.

A criticism of the scoring criteria for organizing human resources

1- Assigning 12 scores for each year of service, without giving due consideration to quality-oriented and specialized criteria in evaluating performance is excessive. Here, the type of service provided in the academic year was completely disregarded. In fact, the service time has only been scored, which was strongly noted by the interviewees.

2- In terms of guardianship, the allocation of only 1 score for each dependent is significantly inadequate. The research participants consistently emphasize the importance of strengthening the family core and ensuring its stability. They argue that employees should not face a decline in work motivation when assigned to remote villages due to family responsibilities. Moreover, given the significance of addressing mental health concerns among staff and considering family-related matters, assigning only one score to this crucial issue is insufficient. The proposed model should adequately acknowledge and integrate this aspect.

3- In the section on incentives and assigning 4 points to a ministerial letter of appreciation. Occasionally, letters of appreciation are granted and bestowed upon certain colleagues. This policy does not align with the educational

objectives of the organization. According to the researcher's viewpoint, it is important to consider allocating scores to training-related activities during the service year.

4- The existing model of allocating 12 scores for a national ranking in an activity requires significant financial resources and time commitment from employees. This model is designed to be suitable for the country and serves as an inspiring factor.

5- The current allocation of scores for the head of the curriculum at the provincial level during the academic year is inadequate. For instance, assigning a score of four for four hours a week undermines the motivation of highly skilled and experienced employees to enhance the educational quality of the system. Consequently, this hampers the efforts to monitor the quality of activities.

6- The assessment score conducted annually through a separate form has received significant criticism from the participants interviewed here. According to interviews conducted, it was found that approximately 60% of the score is assigned by the manager without any supporting documentation. This subjective evaluation process has raised concerns among participants, as these points were allocated without considering the actual performance or contributions.

7- The existing assessment and grading framework for employees fail to take into account their working conditions, environment, and the accessibility of resources and equipment. This aspect has been emphasized by the interviewees who proclaim that it is unjust to disregard

conditions that impede equal opportunities for all employees.

8- The current model does not address the satisfaction of parents and clientele. In addition, less emphasis is made on the quality assessment of students. Furthermore, quality is the only element missing in these assessments.

9- In the present assessment system, research is given the least importance. For instance, the score for conducting a research project, with all the sophistication and challenges, is comparable to only a quarter of the score for serving one academic year. This is while the scoring system remains silent about the annual service, how they are provided, and their quality.

10- The participants emphasized the significant role of quality within the educational system. Their statements underscore the importance of specialization, specifically the alignment between the field of study and the nature of the service provided. This correlation is seen as a critical issue disregarded in the current organization system.

11- The significance of considering the number of dependents in the organization and preparation was strongly highlighted by the interviewees. This is while the present structure has not paid any special attention to that.

12- The interviewees have consistently emphasized the rightful demand for client satisfaction, people-orientedness, and a customer-oriented approach within the educational system. However, they have pointed out that the current system lacks sufficient attention to these aspects.

13- The participants emphasized the significance of content production,

innovation, and the expectations placed on teachers in this regard. They highlighted that the absence of such efforts would lead to a negative score.

14- The participants in the interviews emphasized that the privileges granted to children should be unrestricted. They highlighted that the location of teachers' service and the provision of benefits for their families should be proportionate to the number of family members. This has been neglected in the existing organization process.

Ethical considerations

During the implementation of this research and the preparation of the article, all national laws and principles of professional ethics related to the subject of research, including the rights of statistical community, organizations and institutions, as well as authors and writers have been observed. Adherence to the principles of research ethics in the present study was observed and consent forms were consciously completed by all statistical community.

Sponsorship

The present study was funded by the authors of the article.

Conflict of interest

According to the authors of the present article, there was no conflict of interest.

This article has not been previously published in any journal, whether domestic or foreign, and has been sent to the *Journal of School Administration Quarterly* for review and publication only.

References

- Ahmadi Kohjog, M. (2014). Comparison of time use and satisfaction with time management in mothers of cerebral palsy children with mothers of healthy children. *Research in rehabilitation sciences*, 8(1).
- Ahmadi, H., Bablan, Alee, Z., Moradi, M., & Khaliqkhan, A. (2016). Factors affecting the retention of elite and talented teachers in the second period of secondary education in public schools of Ardabil city in line with the general policies of creating transformation in the education system. *Strategic Public Policy Quarterly*, 7(23), 95-111.
- Alwani, S. M. (2014). Optimal use of time in management. *Journal of administrative change*, 3(12), 26-40
- Asadi, F., Mozafari, S., & Zarei, A. (2016). The relationship between human resource management and organizational performance from the perspective of experts from the staff of the Ministry of Youth Sports of Iran. *Contemporary researches in sports management*, 7(13): 23-30.
- Atkins, T. (2015). the relationship among uses of team management techniques source of stress in high school principals. Dissertation abstract – University of Connecticut.
- Azad, S. (2018). Analyzing the concept of strategic management of human resources and its role in the success of the organization. *New Researches in Management and Accounting*, 56, 209-224.
- Beukani, J., Omidasl, B., Karimi, S., & Beukani, P. (2013). Investigating the functions of human resources management of the Education Department of Behmai city with strategic planning. The second international conference on managing challenges and solutions,
- Bigdali, M., Davodi, R., Kamali, N., & Intisarfarmani, G. (2017). Identifying the dimensions and components of improving human resources in education in order to provide a conceptual model. *Human Resource Management Research Quarterly*, 10(2), 73-100.
- Boxall, P. (2014). The future of employment relations from the perspective of human resource management. *Journal of Industrial Relations*, 56, 578-593.
- Brown, C., & Militello, M. (2016). Principal's perceptions of effective professional development in schools. *Journal of Educational Administration*, 6(4), 56-67.
- Daniels, S., Wang, G. Lawong, R., & Ferris, G. (2016). Collective assessment of the human resources management field: Meta-analytic needs and theory development prospects for the future. *Human Resource Management Review*.
- Fadai Kivani, R., & Sadat Ashkuri, Z. (2016). "The place of education in the development of human resources of today's organizations", 5(7), 1-9.
- Fundamental transformation document. (2011). Document on the fundamental transformation of education and upbringing, Mashhad: Supreme Council of Cultural Revolution.
- Ghanbari, M., Falah, V., & Zameni, F. (2015). Investigating the role of electronic human resources management on organizational effectiveness in Golestan province's education and training organization. *Quarterly Journal of Information and Communication*

Technology in Educational Sciences, 25, 39-59.

Guoqing, Z. (2013). space and time in organizational change management, *journal of women in management review*, vol: 15, no: 7.

Ikyanyon, D., & Johnson, P. (2020). Institutional context and human resource management in Nigeria. *Employee Relations*, 42(1), 1-16.

Kacmaz, R., & Serinkan, C. (2014). Human resource management practices in international sebat educational schools. *Procedia - Social and Behavioral Sciences*, 4809-4813.

Kucharcikova, A., Tokarcikova, E., & Blaskova, M. (2015). Human Capital Management – Aspect of the Human Capital Efficiency in University Education, *Procedia. Social and Behavioral Sciences*, 177, 48-60.

Mahdavi, M., Sheikhul-Islam, N., Hassan Moradi, N., & Shokri, N. (1400). Designing a native model of human resources capability maturity among faculty members of Islamic Azad University of Fars province based on foundation data theory. *A bimonthly scientific-research journal of a new approach in educational management*, 34, 24-32.

Mardani Shahr, B., & Khaki, A. (2018). Presenting the productivity model of armed forces university employees with emphasis on the role of information and communication technology. *Human Resource Management Research Quarterly of Imam Hossein University (AS)*, 11(2), consecutive, 36, 167-189

Masoomzadeh, T., & Malai, A. (2014). Factors affecting the recruitment

and employment of competent human resources in West Azerbaijan education. *National conference of the third millennium and humanities*.

Mousavi, S.H., & Koh Khahzadeh, S. (2018). The necessity of training and improving human resources in education, *The second Conference Among international Psychology. Science educational And Science human*.

Rafiei1, N., & Davari, F. (2015). The Role of Human Resources Management on Enhancing the Teaching Skills of Faculty Members. *Journal of the Academy of Sciences of Bosnia and Herzegovina*, 27 (1), 35-38.

Rahimi, A. & Qanati, N. (2014). Empowerment of human resources (case study of employees of the Ministry of Education). *Journal of Cultural Management*, 9(27), 1-13.

Rezaian, A. (2015). Principles of organization and management. Tehran: Side. (in Persian).

Shirbagi, N., Hossemi, S. M., & Kazemi, A. (2022). Leadership Creativity Scale for School Principals: Development and Application. *School Administration*, 10(2), 147-165.

Sulasmi, E. (2020). The Development Strategy of Human Resources Management In Children's Social Welfare Institution (LKSA) (Case Study in LKSA AL-Mubaraak Orphanage Bengkulu). *Budapest International Research and Critics Institute-Journal (BIRCI-Journal)*. P. 562-569.

Uksup, C., & Sukkamart, A. (2019). “Human resource management needs of Thai basic education”. *Revista Espacios*, 40(17)11.

Author 1 Name: Saman majidi

Email:samanmajidi.sm@gmail.com

Ph.D Student In Educational Administration, Sanandaj Branch, Islamic Azad University, Sanandaj, Iran.

Author 2 Name: Majid mohamadi

Email:majid.mohamadi2622@gmail.com

Department of Educational Sciences, Sanandaj Branch, Islamic Azad University, Sanandaj, Iran Iran (corresponding author).

Author 3 Name: Rafigh hasani

Email:hasani.rafigh@gmail.com

Department of Educational Sciences, Sanandaj Branch, Islamic Azad University, Sanandaj, Iran.